



13. HERITAGE REINSTATEMENT PROGRAMME – JUBILEE CLOCK TOWER

General Manager responsible:	General Manager Corporate Services, DDI 941-8528
Officer responsible:	Property Asset Manager
Author:	Matthew Noyes – Heritage Reinstatement Programme Manager

PURPOSE OF REPORT

1. To seek approval to move forward with the post-earthquake permanent repair for Victoria Clock Tower (Jubilee Clock), corner Montreal and Victoria Streets.



2. The recommended strategy is to repair the clock tower to 67 per cent New Building Standards (NBS), and for the clock to be fully restored.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

3. Victoria Clock Tower is of considerable national and regional significance making an important contribution to the identity, sense of place and history of the Canterbury region. It is listed as a Group Two heritage item in the Christchurch City Plan and is registered as Category I Historic Place by the New Zealand Historic Places Trust.
4. Victoria Clock Tower is ranked as the number 4 priority¹ (out of 55 buildings) for the Heritage Reinstatement Programme.
5. The tower suffered damage in the February earthquake.
6. Damage is generally limited to the dislocation of stones within the arches and buttress columns at the base of the tower. Some individual stones are significantly dislodged and held loosely in place pending the repair and seismic strengthening project commencing. Other non-structural damage includes the bending over of the finial spike.
7. Total insurance on the asset is \$1,016,117; the loss adjuster has offered support for the majority of the repair cost at \$704,194.95 with an additional \$36,890 for contested costs not yet agreed.
8. The contested works relate to an artesian spring, which needs to be redirected to ensure water damage does not occur to the clock tower foundations. The engineering advice is to carry out this work as soon as practical and AON advise this will be without prejudice to claim the cost of the works at a later date. Staff recommend that the work is commenced as soon as possible and that the remaining contested costs are claimed from insurers.
9. The 67 per cent NBS target supports the Council's 'Earthquake-Prone, Dangerous and Insanitary Buildings Policy 2010'.

¹ Based on the draft prioritisation framework for the Heritage Reinstatement Programme – dated 23/05/12

13 Cont'd

GEOTECH SUMMARY & ENGINEERING ASSESSMENT

10. The Qualitative Assessment calculated the clock tower strength at less than 33 per cent NBS.
11. A geotechnical assessment was carried out in July 2011. The majority of damage is described as being a result of earthquake shaking. The report mentions that underlying liquefaction was identified at an adjacent site and also points out the artesian water issue. The overall recommendation was that no further geotechnical work was required, unless new foundations for the structure were proposed.

INSURANCE AND STRENGTHENING COSTS

12. Total earthquake repairs and strengthening to the above ground structure is at a cost of \$704,194.95 and is supported by the loss adjuster.
13. The artesian well head repairs are costed at \$36,890 and not yet accepted by the loss adjuster as an insured cost despite it being earthquake related; and is presented here as contested works.
14. The artesian well head below the tower has incurred earthquake damage and requires civil engineering repairs and redirection of water to the storm system. The repairs are required as there is risk that the clock tower foundations will further deteriorate. The engineering advice is to carry out this work as soon as practicable.
15. Tim Stephenson (Loss Adjuster for Civic Insurance) has provided the following statement:

The Loss Adjusting Team confirms its support of this specification and scope of works. The budget estimate of \$704,194.95 is supported, although it is noted that this is an estimate only and actual costs will vary. The project manager will control costs and advise of actual costs as they crystallise.

It should be noted that while the LAT indicates support for a specification that allows strengthening of the structure to 67 per cent NBS, this is on the advice of the project manager that there is negligible difference between this and strengthening to 34 per cent. Should the specification, scope of works and/ or budget vary from that presented, the LAT reserve its position in this regard and would review any such variation.

Furthermore, and for clarity only, it should be noted that the budget allows for Stage 1 of the remediation of the artesian water supply. The budget does not allow for Stage 2 (artesian well repair), and this is not supported herein; insurers have corresponded separately on this matter.

16. AON have advised that undertaking contested works would be without prejudice to claim the amount at a later date (depending on policy response). However, this cost will need to be council funded in the interim.

BETTERMENT

17. Additional resilience strategies were considered and discounted for engineering reasons (e.g. the tower has the wrong height to width ratio for effective base isolation); other than conventional strengthening. To bring the strength of the clock tower up to 100 per cent NBS by conventional strengthening would have significant impact to the heritage fabric, would not provide life critical protection (tower is unoccupied) and be a council cost with low perceived value so is not recommended.
18. Several options have been proposed for the future display of the time on the Victoria Clock Tower:
 - (a) Fix the clock completely: This will ensure the clock maintains its original purpose as a dedicated memorial to Queen Victoria's Jubilee and of telling the time for the citizens of Christchurch and remain

COUNCIL 26. 7. 2012

13 Cont'd

- (b) Four faces remain at 12.51pm: The clock will not be fulfilling its purpose and there will be complaints that the time is not correct. Overseas/out of town visitors may not comprehend this. There would be an additional cost of \$1,000 for this specialist work.
- (c) One face remains at 12.51pm: The clock will not be fulfilling its purpose and there will be complaints that the time is not correct. Overseas/out of town visitors may not comprehend this. There would be an additional cost of \$500 for this specialist work.
19. The recommendation is for Option 1 "Fix the clock completely" due to the reliance people place on the clock to provide them with the time. As a memorial to Queen Victoria's Jubilee it may not be perceived as appropriate to mix memorial subjects. A proposal for a permanent National Memorial is being developed with much public support, the cumulative effect of numerous small memorials around the CBD could be perceived to diffuse the memorial message and reduce the sanctity of the memorial. To make an alteration in the meaning and purpose of this 1897 memorial clock tower that would have a significant effect on the social historical and intangible heritage values of this heritage item.
20. A clock condition assessment and other urgent non-earthquake related works have been assessed at \$13,000. This would make use of the scaffold and access systems available and so provide a similar future cost saving.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

21. A summary of the financial options is included below:

Option 1: TO REPAIR TO 67% NBS

Repair Elements:	Insurer to Pay:	Council to Pay:
Repairs to NBS 67%	\$704,195.95	\$0
Artesian Water Repair	\$36,890.00*	\$0
Clock Maintenance	\$0	\$13,000.00
TOTAL:	\$741,085.95	\$13,000.00

Option 2: TO REPAIR TO 100% NBS

Repair Elements:	Insurer to Pay:	Council to Pay:
Repairs to NBS 67%	\$704,195.95	\$0
Repairs to NBS 100%	\$0	\$58,240.00
Artesian Water Repair	\$36,890.00*	\$0
Clock Maintenance	\$0	\$13,000.00
TOTAL:	\$741,085.95	\$71,240.00

* This element is not yet agreed to by insurers and would be funded by Council in anticipation of obtaining this agreement.

22. The recommended option is for 67 per cent NBS with a total cost of \$741,085.95 including \$36,890 of works not yet agreed to by the insurer. This does not include freezing the clock faces.
23. The maintenance of the clock is a routine item that will be funded by the Council's maintenance budget.

BENEFIT OF REPAIR

24. This is a highly utilised and well liked timepiece which is used by the public on a daily basis.
25. Allows the continuation and appreciation of our heritage significance for future generations.
26. Provides physical evidence of our rich history in particular the link with the prominent architect Mountfort and other prominent heritage buildings, such as the Canterbury Provincial Buildings.

13 Cont'd

RISK OF DOING NOTHING

27. Further heritage is lost.
28. The asset will deteriorate and the cost of future repair will increase.
29. Public outcry – this asset is closely monitored by a number of external stakeholders who are concerned with its current condition and have been seeking assurances on its repair.

HERITAGE SUMMARY

30. The Victoria Clock Tower is of architectural significance for its unique design by Mountfort and the later base designed by Strouts and Ballantyne.
31. It is of cultural significance for its association with Canterbury Provincial Government (1853-76), and as a Jubilee memorial to Queen Victoria. 'Diamond Jubilee 1837-1897' is inscribed in a stone tablet on the east side of the stone base.
32. The upper part of the clock tower was constructed by Midland Counties Iron Works in Coventry or Skidmore and Sons in Coventry, England and sent out to New Zealand in 1860 in 142 packages. The base employs Mount Somers, Port Chalmers and Timaru stone, and a high level of stonemasonry skill for the period (1890s) is evident in the work.
33. The clock tower and setting are of archaeological significance because they have potential to provide archaeological evidence relating to past building construction methods and materials, and other human activity.

Do the Recommendations of this Report Align with LTCCP budgets?

34. No. The purpose of this report is to gain approval for permanent repair / reinstatement works on heritage buildings as per Council policy.

LEGAL CONSIDERATIONS

35. Not applicable.

Have you considered the legal implications of the issue under consideration?

36. As above.

ALIGNMENT WITH LTCCP AND ACTIVITY MANAGEMENT PLANS

37. No. The purpose of this report is to gain approval for permanent repair / reinstatement works on heritage buildings as per Council policy.

Do the recommendations of this report support a level of service or project in the LTCCP?

38. As above.

ALIGNMENT WITH STRATEGIES

39. Yes the purpose of this report supports the facilities rebuild strategy and assists with the rebuild of Christchurch.
40. The repair of the Victoria Clock Tower is aligned with the LTCCP Community Outcome "An Attractive and Well-designed City". In particular protecting our heritage for future generations.

Do the recommendations align with the Council's strategies?

41. Yes, refer above.

13 Cont'd

CONSULTATION FULFILMENT

42. Not applicable. Communication and consultation will be a project workstream.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that Council:

- (a) Approve the reinstatement / repairs for Victoria Clock Tower with a total budget of \$741,086.
- (b) Approve the option for repairing the Clock Tower to a 67 per cent New Building Standards.
- (c) Approve the option to reinstate the clock to full working condition.

Appendix 1: Jubilee Clock Tower Heritage Assessment

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE VICTORIA STREET CLOCK TOWER/JUBILEE CLOCK TOWER

INTRODUCTION:

The Victoria Clock Tower is of considerable regional significance making an important contribution to the identity, sense of place and history of the Canterbury region. The clock section was originally made for the Canterbury Provincial Council Buildings. However it never served that purpose and was constructed as a Jubilee memorial to Queen Victoria. The Clock Tower is of architectural significance for its unique design by Mountfort and the later base designed by Strouts and Ballantyne. The Clock Tower is of technological and craftsmanship significance for its ornate Victorian detailing and use of stone, glass and wrought iron. It is a Christchurch landmark that is recognised and identified with regionally.

HISTORICAL AND SOCIAL SIGNIFICANCE

The upper part of the Victoria Street Clock Tower was constructed in 1859 in England and was intended to have been incorporated into the Canterbury Provincial Council buildings complex, however it was too heavy for its intended site. Subsequently the structure was temporarily stored in the courtyard at the Provincial Council Buildings until 1864, then in the Christchurch City Council yards. In 1897, the 60th Jubilee of Queen Victoria's Reign was celebrated in the city, and the structure was incorporated into a memorial clock tower, with a stone base. The cost of the Clock Tower was shared between the Council and the public. In 1897 a competition held for the design of the stone base, on which the tower was eventually erected, was won by Strouts and Ballantyne. This was erected at the corner of High, Lichfield and Manchester Streets. The increasing volume of traffic at this intersection resulted in the decision to relocate the tower, and it was erected on its present site in Victoria Street in 1930. After refurbishment work in 1976, the clock was renamed the Provincial Government Clock as a mark of its original intent (*The Star*, 31.5.2000), however this name does not appear to have entered into popular use.

CULTURAL AND SPIRITUAL SIGNIFICANCE

The Victoria Clock Tower is of cultural significance for its association with Canterbury Provincial government (1853-76), and as a Jubilee memorial to Queen Victoria. 'Diamond Jubilee 1837-1897' is inscribed in a stone tablet on the east side of the stone base. Another stone tablet is inscribed "Erected by Citizens of Christchurch NZ in commemoration of the Diamond Jubilee of HJM Victoria R et J". Public clocks and drinking fountains played a more integral part of the community's day to day life when the Clock Tower was designed for the Provincial Council Buildings in 1859 and erected as a stand alone clock tower in 1897. The public clock assisted citizens to reset their time to a standard time for the City, and therefore played a vital role in the early development of the City.

ARCHITECTURAL AND AESTHETIC SIGNIFICANCE

The Victoria Clock Tower is of architectural and aesthetic significance for its design in two stages by two local architects. Benjamin Woolfield Mountfort, architect of the Canterbury Provincial Buildings, designed the upper portions of the tower in 1859. Mountfort's original design was somewhat modified due to the cost. His design becomes increasingly delicate as it ascends and originally the wrought iron railing and scroll work were covered in gold leaf (NZHPT Website). Benjamin Woolfield Mountfort (1825-98) trained as an architect in England, and arrived in Canterbury in 1850. He became New Zealand's pre-eminent Gothic Revival architect. He was involved in many important commissions including a number of churches, the Canterbury Museum (1869-82) and the Clock-tower Block on the Canterbury College campus (1876-77).

Frederick Strouts (1834-1919) was born in England, and trained as an architect there. . He became noted for his houses, and in 1871 he was appointed supervising architect for the Church of St Michael and All Angels. He formed a practice partnership with his former pupil Robert Ballantyne. The clock tower was restored in 1978, and chimes were added to the clock mechanism. The clock tower was also restored in c2002, including the painting of some of the wrought iron work in gold leaf. A decorative cast iron drinking fountain is located within the tower.

TECHNOLOGICAL AND CRAFTSMANSHIP SIGNIFICANCE

The upper part of the clock tower was constructed by Midland Counties Iron Works in Coventry or Skidmore and Sons in Coventry, England and sent out to New Zealand in 1860 in 142 packages. The base employs Mount Somers, Port Chalmers and Timaru stone, and a high level of stonemasonry skill for the period (1890s) is evident in the work. The ornate wrought iron also shows the high degree of skill in this medium which was practised in England at the time (1850s). The clock mechanism was replaced in 1930 with new telechron gearing, new hands, and plate glass dials on each face (The Press 9.7.1929, p.10).

CONTEXTUAL SIGNIFICANCE

The setting of the clock tower consists of a triangular area of land on the corner of Victoria, Salisbury and Montreal Streets. Low height rose plantings are located in formal garden beds immediately at its base. The clock tower is located directly in front of Victoria Mansions, an art deco apartment block, and together the buildings form a group of heritage structures, along with the former dwelling on the corner of Salisbury and Montreal Street. The setting of the clock tower provides for its landmark visual presence in the streetscape, on a significant intersection in the city. The clock tower is also associated with the Canterbury Provincial Council Buildings, which is located a few blocks away, but which shares the materials and detailing of the Mountfort designed portions of the clock tower.

ARCHAEOLOGICAL SIGNIFICANCE

The clock tower and setting are of archaeological significance because they have potential to provide archaeological evidence relating to past building construction methods and materials, and other human activity. The setting in Victoria Street has potential to provide evidence of human activity prior to 1900, as the Street was a main thoroughfare centre of commercial and other activity for the early European settlers.

*Report by Jenny May based on the CCC Heritage Building assessment criteria and file information
May 2012*