

COUNCIL 12. 7. 2012

22. HERITAGE REINSTATEMENT PROGRAMME – EDMONDS CLOCK TOWER

General Manager responsible:	General Manager Corporate Services, DDI 941-8528	
Officer responsible:	Property Asset Manager	
Author:	Rahcel Shaw – Heritage Reinstatment Programme Manager	

PURPOSE OF REPORT

 To seek approval to move forward with the post-earthquake permanent repair at Edmonds Clock Tower (Madras St Clock Tower), located at the intersection of Madras Street and Oxford Terrace.



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 2. The Edmonds Clock Tower is listed in the City Plan as a Group 2 heritage building. Its heritage significance is also recognised by the New Zealand Historic Places Trust Pouhere Taonga who registers the building as a Category II Historic Place.
- 3. The clock tower suffered damage in the February 2011 and June 2011 earthquakes. Significant stablisation has taken place and the top section of the clock has been removed as a result of 'make safe' requirements.
- 4. Damage includes two horizontal sheer failure planes extending around the perimeter of the tower at the top and the base of the lower level window openings.
- 5. The clock tower is insured for \$485,478. The total repair budget is \$260,000, designed to 67 per cent of code.
- 6. The total cost exposure for Council is \$6,000 for betterment.
- 7. The 67 per cent target aligns with the Council's 'Earthquake-Prone, Dangerous and Insanitary Buildings Policy 2010'. This policy states that the new target for structural strengthening is 67 per cent of code.
- 8. Is it not practical to design to 100 per cent New Building Standard. The design solution would be significantly more complex and would be highly intrusive to the existing heritage fabric. For this reason it has not been further explored.
- 9. The permanent repair works have been issued with a resource consent.
- 10. Routine clock maintenance will be performed at the same time as the structural repairs and this will be funded from existing business as usual budgets.

22 Cont'd

GEOTECH SUMMARY & ENGINEERING ASSESSMENT

- 11. A geotechnical assessment was carried out which noted: "the tower is located within a zone of lateral spreading extending 230 metres back from the river, it appears to be located on a raft of land which appears to have undergone little internal deformation in the vacinity of the clock tower despite the lateral movement". While liquefaction is likely to have occurred at depth, visually the clock tower does not appear to have subsided as a result. No further geotechnical work was considered to be required.
- 12. The Qualitative Assessment completed in August 2011 calculated the clocks strength as likely to be less than 33 per cent NBS.
- 13. The proposed repair solution will increase the overall building strength to a minimum of 67 per cent NBS.

INSURANCE & STRENGHTENING COSTS

14. Tim Stephenson (Loss Adjuster for Cunningham & Lindsey) provided the following statement on 14 May 2012:

The LAT has been asked to set out insurer's current position regarding insured damage/works elements at Edmonds St Clock Tower. Hence we submit this snapshot, noting that insurers may amend their position if further information suggests a need to do otherwise.

Insight Unlimited have tendered a specification and scope of work for the earthquake-related repairs to this site.

Based on the specification and scope, Insight has tendered an updated budget of \$260,000+GST for the reinstatement of earthquake-related damage, without consideration of any betterment or repair of uninsured damage, and with limited strengthening of the damaged portion of the structure.

This is comprised as follows;

Preliminary works (completed) \$ 30,021.87 Fulton Hogan fixed price quote \$ 190,264.47 Professional fees \$ 39,713.66

Insurers accept the specification and scope and can support \$260,000+GST; noting assetspecific sums insured apply in every case.

Insurers reserve the right to review their level of support for strengthening, should any additional strengthening be found to be required during the reinstatement process. As a fixed price cost has been tendered, it appears unlikely that such a possibility would arise.

BETTERMENT

15. There is no planned betterment.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

16. The cost exposure to Council is nil.

Option 1: TO REPAIR TO 67% NBS

Repair Elements:	Insurer to Pay:	Council to Pay:
Repairs to NBS 34%	\$0	\$0
Repairs to NBS 67%	\$260,000	\$0
Other Betterment	\$0	\$0
Q4 Repairs	\$0	\$0
TOTAL:	\$260,000	\$0

22 Cont'd

BENEFIT OF REPAIR

- 17. The repaired asset will serve as a reminder and evidence of our past history. In particular the conection with locally based, and nationally successful businessman Thomas Edmonds along with the clock towers contribution to the Avon River landscape.
- 18. The clock will continue to inform the time.

RISK OF DOING NOTHING

- 19. Further aftershocks will cause additional damage and deterioration to the clock tower.
- 20. It may continue to detract visitors from the city.

HERITAGE SUMMARY

- 21. Erected in 1929 the clock tower is part of a group of gifts along the Avon River from prominent businessman and philanthropist Thomas Edmonds to commemorate the Jubilee of his residence in the city.
- 22. Designed by H. Francis Willis, in what is termed the Free Style of the late nineteenth century English architecture, the clock tower is square in plan and constructed from a mixture of volcanic rock with Mt Somers limestone facings.
- 23. There are two clock faces, east and west. Medallions portraying a figure as Father Time bears more than a passing resemblance to Thomas Edmonds, immortalizing Edmonds like the Roman emperors of antiquity.
- 24. Gothic elements include the use of buttresses, tracery in the small windows gargoyles in the form of lion heads, stylized leaves and the slightly pointed arch on the door panel. There is a variety of styles and complexity of symbolism on the clock tower including an owl symbolizing wisdom and a squirrel with an acanthus leave stylized as a tail. William Trethewey, a monumental mason and sculptor, was responsible for the decorative carvings.

Do the Recommendations of this Report Align with LTCCP budgets?

25. No. The purpose of this report is to gain approval for permanent repair / reinstatement works on heritage buildings as per Council policy.

LEGAL CONSIDERATIONS

26. Not applicable.

Have you considered the legal implications of the issue under consideration?

27. As above.

ALIGNMENT WITH LTCCP AND ACTIVITY MANAGEMENT PLANS

28. No. The purpose of this report is to gain approval for permanent repair / reinstatement works on heritage buildings as per Council policy.

Do the recommendations of this report support a level of service or project in the LTCCP?

29. As above.

COUNCIL 12. 7. 2012

22 Cont'd

ALIGNMENT WITH STRATEGIES

- 30. Yes the purpose of this report supports the facilities rebuild strategy and assists with the rebuild of Christchurch.
- 31. The repair of the Edmonds Clock Tower is aligned with the LTCCP Community Outcome "An Attractive and Well-designed City". In particular protecting our heritage for future generations.

Do the recommendations align with the Council's strategies?

32. Yes, refer above.

CONSULTATION FULFILMENT

33. Not applicable. Communication and consultation will be a project workstream.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Council approve the insurance reinstatement / repairs for Edmonds Clock Tower.

Appendix 1: Edmonds Clock Tower Heritage Assessment

HERITAGE ASSESSMENT LISTED HERITAGE PLACE EDMONDS CLOCK TOWER AND TELEPHONE CABINET



HERITAGE ASSESSMENT

The clock tower and telephone cabinet were erected in 1929 and are of historical and social significance for their connection with prominent businessman and philanthropist Thomas Edmonds, who donated £5,000 towards the River Bank Improvement Scheme, comprising the clock tower and telephone cabinet/drinking fountain on Madras Street along with the band rotunda and shelter on the Cambridge Terrace riverbank upstream of Manchester Street to commemorate his 50 years in Christchurch.

The clock tower and telephone cabinet are of architectural and aesthetic significance for their design by Christchurch architect H Francis Willis. Willis was known for his work in the Art Deco and Spanish Mission styles popular in the 1920s and 30s such as New Regent Street and the Repertory Theatre. The telephone cabinet is both decorative and functional, providing shelter for making phone calls, posting letters and a drinking fountain. Thomas Edmonds appears to have had significant input into the design and detailing of both structures and one of the medallions is said to be in his likeness.

The clock tower and telephone cabinet are of contextual significance for their relationship to one another within the setting, and their relationship to the Avon River. The group also relates to the Edmonds band rotunda and shelter on the corner of Manchester Street and Cambridge Terrace. The Clock tower is a landmark in the city because of its prominent location and its distinctive appearance. The setting of the clock tower and telephone cabinet consists of the triangle of grass lawn, which was formed by the Christchurch Beautifying Association in 1902.

The clock tower and telephone cabinet are of technological and craftsmanship for their construction in volcanic rock and plastered reinforced concrete with Somers limestone facings. Christchurch sculptor William Trethewey was responsible for the decorative carving on the tower and cabinet which shows a high standard of workmanship.

The place is of potential archaeological significance, as the Avon River and its banks were used first by local Maori and later by the early Europeans, prior to 1900.

STATEMENT OF HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The Edmonds clock tower and telephone cabinet are of regional heritage significance for their connection with locally based, and nationally successful businessman Thomas Edmonds, their design by local architect H Francis Willis and contribution to the Avon River landscape in central Christchurch.

REFERENCES:

CCC Heritage file

ASSESSMENT COMPLETED: 10.12.2007 AUTHOR: Amanda Ohs

PEER REVIEWED: +.+.+ REVIEWER: +
ASSESSMENT UPDATED: +.+.+ AUTHOR: +