

3. MARSHLAND ROAD (JOY STREET TO LAKE TERRACE ROAD) REMEDIAL WORK

General Manager responsible:	General Manager City Environment
Officer responsible:	Transport and City Streets Manager
Author:	Lee Kelly, Senior Capital Programme Consultation Leader, DDI 941-8355

PURPOSE OF REPORT

1. The purpose of this report is to seek support from the Burwood/Pegasus and Shirley/Papanui Community Boards for the Marshland Road (Joy Street to Lake Terrace Road) remedial work, and to recommend to Council that the project proceed to implementation.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

2. In May 2005 the Council commenced marking new cycle lanes, median and parking restrictions on Marshland Road, as the result of a project plan that was approved in September 2004. The work was stopped just prior to completion, in response to community dissatisfaction with the impact on the roadway, effects on on-street parking, and a consultation process that omitted some important actions.
3. Board resolutions subsequently required remedial work on this section of Marshland Road to address the concerns of residents and business owners who had been negatively impacted by the loss of on street parks resulting from the project.
4. The proposed remedial work and the options presented in this report are the result of in-depth consultation with some of the residents and business owners in this section of Marshland Road along with the two residents' associations representing the area, and both the Burwood/Pegasus and Shirley/Papanui Community Boards.
5. The Council's recommended option maintains the current markings, and adds indented parking bays. Eleven additional on street parks can be catered for. This option is not well supported by the community. A second option has been assessed, and has community support, that would see the new 1.8 metre wide cycle lane markings removed and a combination of 1.5 metre wide and 1.8 metre wide cycle lanes installed. This would allow for a total of 140 on-street parking spaces - the majority reinstated on the east side of the road, with some lost spaces on the west side to accommodate the pedestrian island accesses. This option is not the Council's recommended option, as it compromises current marking standards for cycle lanes and removes a continuous central median which provides pedestrian and right-turning vehicle collision risk reduction.
6. Included in both options is the proposal to change the service road adjacent to O'Shea's Public House and the TAB to a north to south one way traffic flow - which, as a result of recent LTNZ information, is a requirement. Further, both options will implement parking-tick marks adjacent to residential driveways on the west side of the road, opposite the retail area, to reduce the incidence of vehicles parking too close to narrow driveways, and restricting owner access.
7. The preferred option proposes the installation of four pedestrian median islands; the alternative option installs three.
8. The plans for the two options for Marshland Road are attached. The report contains the parking restrictions needed for resolutions depending on the option approved.

FINANCIAL AND LEGAL CONSIDERATIONS

9. The recommended option has been estimated at \$180,000, against a remaining capital budget for the road project of \$100,000. The over-expenditure of this project will be managed through substitution and/or deferral of other projects within the cycleways budget.
10. There are no legal issues associated with this project. No-stopping restrictions require combined Board resolutions to be legally enforceable.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the combined Burwood/Pegasus and Shirley/Papanui Community Boards:

1. Support the recommended option as shown on attached plans TP165206, TP165206a and TP165206b as "Preferred Option" to proceed to Council for approval for construction.
2. Support the following parking restrictions to proceed to Council for approval:

General

- (a) That all existing parking restrictions in Marshland Road in that section between Joy Street and Lake Terrace Road be rescinded.

Marshland Road - East Side

- (b) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Lake Terrace Road and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 70 metres.
- (c) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Cotton Street and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 13 metres.
- (d) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Cotton Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (e) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Cotton Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (f) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Cotton Street and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 12 metres.
- (g) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at the common boundary of 166 and 164 Marshland Road, and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 30 metres.
- (h) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at the common boundary of 158 and 156 Marshland Road, and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 80 metres.
- (i) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Pagoda Street and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 14 metres.
- (j) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Pagoda Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 10 metres.
- (k) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Pagoda Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 10 metres.
- (l) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Pagoda Street and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 25 metres.

- (m) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at the northernmost limit of the service lane island, adjacent to the common boundary of 138 and 122 Marshland Road, and extending in a southerly direction for 64 metres.
- (n) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at a point 40 metres north of the common boundary of 114 and 112 Marshland Road, and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 120 metres.
- (o) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Joy Street and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (p) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Joy Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (q) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Joy Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 9 metres.

Marshland Road - West Side

- (r) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Amos Place and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 25 metres.
- (s) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Amos Place commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in a westerly direction for a distance of 8 metres.
- (t) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Amos Place commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in a westerly direction for a distance of 8 metres.
- (u) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Amos Place and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 45 metres.
- (v) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road at a point 9 metres north from the common boundary of 119 and 119A Marshland Road and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 14 metres.
- (w) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Voss Street and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 22 metres.
- (x) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Voss Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in a westerly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (y) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Voss Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in a westerly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (z) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at the common boundary of 161 and 163 Marshland Road and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 8 metres.
- (aa) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing the common boundary of 181 and 183 Marshland Road and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 600 metres.

New Parking Restriction - Service Lane

- (bb) That the existing no stopping restriction within the service lane, commencing at the common boundary of 118 and 116 Marshland Road and extending in a southerly direction for 36 metres be rescinded.
- (cc) That the parking of vehicles be restricted to a maximum period of 10 minutes on the east side of the Marshland Road service lane, commencing at the common boundary of 118 and 116 Marshland Road, and extending in southerly direction for 36 metres.

Bus Stop Relocation

- (dd) That the existing bus stop be revoked from the west side of Marshland Road at its present position commencing 5 metres south of the common boundary of 175 and 177 Marshland Road and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 12.5 metres, and reinstated on the west side of Marshland Road commencing the common boundary of 175 and 177 Marshland Road and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 12.5 metres.

CHAIRPERSON'S RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That in view of the community consultation the Boards support the alternative option as shown on attached plans TP165206, TP165206a and TP165206b as "Alternative Option" to proceed to Council for approval for construction.
2. Support the following parking restrictions to proceed to Council for approval:

General

- (a) That all existing parking restrictions in Marshland Road in that section between Joy Street and Lake Terrace Road be rescinded.

Marshland Road - East Side

- (b) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Lake Terrace Road and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 70 metres.
- (c) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Cotton Street and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 13 metres.
- (d) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Cotton Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (e) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Cotton Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (f) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Cotton Street and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 12 metres.
- (g) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at the common boundary of 162 and 164 Marshland Road and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 18 metres.
- (h) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Pagoda Street and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 43 metres.
- (i) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Pagoda Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 10 metres.
- (j) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Pagoda Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 10 metres.

- (k) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Pagoda Street and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 25 metres.
- (l) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at a point 52 metres south of the northernmost limit of the service lane island, adjacent to the common boundary of 138 and 122 Marshland Road, and extending in a southerly direction 12 metres.
- (m) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at a point 22 metres north of the common boundary of 114 and 112 Marshland Road and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 15 metres.
- (n) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the east side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Joy Street and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (o) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Joy Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (p) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Joy Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in an easterly direction for a distance of 9 metres.

Marshland Road - West Side

- (q) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Amos Place and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 25 metres.
- (r) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Amos Place commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in a westerly direction for a distance of 8 metres.
- (s) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Amos Place commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in a westerly direction for a distance of 8 metres.
- (t) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Amos Place and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 45 metres.
- (u) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at a point 12 metres north of the common boundary of 117 and 119 Marshland Road and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 82 metres.
- (v) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Voss Street and extending in a southerly direction for a distance of 52 metres.
- (w) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the south side of Voss Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in a westerly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (x) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the north side of Voss Street commencing at its intersection with Marshland Road and extending in a westerly direction for a distance of 9 metres.
- (y) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at its intersection with Voss Street and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 12 metres.

- (z) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at a point 10 metres north of the common boundary of 157 and 159 Marshland Road and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 70 metres.
- (aa) That the stopping of vehicles be prohibited at any time on the west side of Marshland Road commencing at a point 10 metres north of the common boundary of 181 and 183 Marshland Road and extending in a northerly direction for a distance of 60 metres.

New Parking Restriction - Service Lane

- (bb) That the existing no stopping restriction within the service lane, commencing at the common boundary of 118 and 116 Marshland Road and extending in a southerly direction for 36 metres be rescinded.
- (cc) That the parking of vehicles be restricted to a maximum period of 10 minutes on the east side of the Marshland Road service lane, commencing at the common boundary of 118 and 116 Marshland Road, and extending in southerly direction for 36 metres.

BACKGROUND TO THE MARSHLAND ROAD (JOY STREET TO LAKE TERRACE ROAD) REMEDIAL WORK

11. In April/May 2004 a project was initiated to widen the cycle lanes existing at the time, and bring them up to a new standard width on Marshland Road, from New Brighton Road intersection to QEII Drive. The existing cycle lanes were 1.2 metres wide which were below the best practice standard at the time, and since the introduction of the latest New Zealand Cycle Facilities Design Guide, were even further below modern standards.
12. A number of options were considered to improve the quality of the cycle facilities at the time, including cycle lane widening and the development of an off-road pathway. The proposed design recommended to the Boards and the STU committee was for widened cycle lanes and the inclusion of a flush (painted) median.
13. Marshland Road for the majority of its length is 19.5 metres wide. To widen the cycle lanes along this wide section did not require the removal of on street parks and therefore did not impact on residents or businesses because the carriageway width was wide enough to accommodate both.
14. However, the carriageway width of Marshland Road between Joy Street and Lake Terrace Road is considerably narrower at only 13 metres wide. Consequently, in this section, the proposed widening of the cycle lanes and development of a median required the removal of all on street parks along the east side of Marshland Road.
15. A public meeting held on 4 August 2004 discussed the options considered, and was advised the preferred option was for on-road cycle lanes with parking removal on the east side.
16. A second public meeting, that had been requested by the residents/business owners/residents' associations and Boards and agreed to by the project team, and planned for November 2004, unfortunately did not take place. Instead, the Marshland Road cycleway project was submitted to the Burwood/Pegasus and Shirley/Papanui Community Boards in September 2004. The report did not make the Burwood/Pegasus meeting agenda, and was not discussed by that Board. The report was presented at the 1 September 2004 Shirley/Papanui meeting, and the resolutions were:

The Board **resolved**:

1. That approval be granted for staff to proceed with final design, tender and construction, the cycle lanes in Marshland Road from Joy Street to 382 Marshland Road excluding the QEII Drive/Marshland Road roundabout.
 2. That the no stopping restrictions as outlined in (i) to (iv) of the staff report be supported.
 3. That staff investigate the possibility of shared parking arrangements between the Garden Hotel and O'Sheas Public House.
17. The project was submitted for STU Committee for approval in 7 September 2004, and was approved for installation.
- That approval be given to proceed to final design, tender and construction of the cycle lanes in Marshland Road from Joy Street to 382 Marshland Road excluding the QEII Drive/Marshland Road roundabout.
18. Council acknowledges that process errors were made in the development, consultation and decision making processes for the Marshland Road cycleway project - particularly the omission of the public meeting in November 2004.
 19. Construction/marketing of the cycle lanes, median and stopping restrictions commenced in April 2005. Residents were surprised and upset by the implementation work, having been led to expect further consultation, and made submissions to the May 2005 meetings of the Burwood/Pegasus and Shirley/Papanui Community Boards.

20. At the meeting of the Burwood/Pegasus Community Board on the 18 May 2005 the following notes/resolutions were made:
- Tony Mander: Golf Links Residents' Association expressed concerns with the consultation process undertaken in 2004 for the cycle lane project and highlighted particular aspects of the project that he believed the community did not support.
 - **Burwood/Pegasus Community Board Recommendation:** That the Council halt the Marshland Road cycleway project until all outstanding matters are resolved satisfactorily.
21. At the meeting of the Shirley/Papanui Community Board on the 18 May 2005 the following notes/resolutions were made:
- Tony Mander, Ian Daniels, Ken Wilson and Ralph Ross (Shirley Residents' Association) expressed their concerns on the consultation process in relation to the Marshland Road cycle lane marking project. The Board received the information, noting the residents' concerns and decided that the Shirley/Papanui Community Board meet with the Burwood/Pegasus Community Board to discuss:
 - **Shirley/Papanui Community Board Recommendation**
 - (a) The consultation process in relation to the Marshland Road cycle lane project be investigated.
 - (b) The Council processes in addressing this issue now.
 - (c) Additional parking for businesses in the area.
 - (d) The need for pedestrian crossing facilities on Marshland Road.
 - (e) Any remedial actions which the Boards may take on behalf of their residents.
22. The full Council received the Shirley/Papanui Community Board Report at its 2 June 2005 meeting. Council minutes do not record any resolutions passed at the Council meeting regarding the Marshland Road cycleway. At the meeting, however, staff undertook to suspend further construction, and not apply the red surfacing to the cycle lanes in the disputed section of Marshland Road until further consultation had taken place. At the 9 June 2005 Council meeting, the Council initiated its closer scrutiny of the cycle strategy.
23. At the current time, Marshland Road is marked as follows:
- 1.8m wide cycle lanes for most of its length.
 - Painted (flush) median for most of its length.
 - No-stopping restrictions on the east side of the road Joy Street to Lake Terrace Road.

ACTIONS SINCE JUNE 2005

24. The Board resolutions required further investigation, consultation and action for Marshland Road. Subsequently, a memo was distributed to both Boards outlining the various factors relating to the Marshland Road cycle lane project that contributed to an outcome that was not supported by the community. The memo included a recommended process to address the concerns which was supported by the Boards. Specifically:
- Consultation be reopened with residents and business owners/operators in the section of Marshland Road between Amos Place and Briggs/Lake Terrace intersection. The consultation would be limited to those issues that were previously raised prior to implementation, for which consultation information is already held. The consultation would provide the Unit with the opportunity to clarify all the issues causing concern and to then work through these issues one by one.
 - Once all issues have been identified and addressed, where possible, with the affected residents/business owners/operators a publicity leaflet could then be produced and delivered to the wider community outlining the proposed changes.

25. Issues identified through study of previous information determined that there were three primary concerns with the new markings for this section of Marshland Road:
- Parking around the businesses in the area (particularly adjacent to O'Shea's and the TAB) is now inadequate.
 - Some private residences have concerns about lack of on-street parking, and where parking exists, there are concerns that vehicles park too close to access cut-downs.
 - Pedestrian crossing facilities on this section of Marshland Road are inadequate.
26. Subsequently, contact was made with local residents groups, some local business and those who responded to the original consultation leaflets. The issues noted above were confirmed as the main technical issues with the new road markings. A further two issues identified with the current markings in place are:
- Vehicles northbound on Marshland Road who right turn into Lake Terrace Road tend to travel on the median marking in an effort to avoid straight-ahead vehicle queuing, creating a multi-lane approach to the intersection, which is perceived as a hazard.
 - Business owner also sought consideration of making the pull-in bay in front of properties 122-116 one-way, to ease vehicle flow through the bay.

OPTIONS AND CONSULTATION

27. In response to the issues raised, seven options were initially drafted, and presented to the first of two public meetings, in September 2005. The options included various combinations of cycle lane widths; on-street parking provision; road widening and off-road pathways.
28. The public meeting effectively eliminated several options, as being undesirable from both the Council's and residents' perspectives, and provided further information and feedback which would be useful in developing options further. After further investigation, four options were drafted and presented at a second public meeting. The second public meeting in October 2005 considered:
- (i) Option 1: Option 1 consisted of reinstating the cycle lanes that existed prior to the marking changes. This option was presented specifically at the request of the businesses and residents as they considered those road markings to be adequate for the use and function of Marshland Road. The layout essentially consisted of underwidth cycle lanes and full parking on both sides of the road. After discussions at the meeting, the community representatives moved away from this option as it failed to provide any road crossing facilities, and the residents and businesses did acknowledge improvements for all road users were possible. Both Council and community representatives saw this option as an unsatisfactory retrograde step.
 - (ii) Option 2: The second option presented was similar to the previous option, in that the cycle lanes were restored to near original widths (ie underwidth by modern standards) with essentially the same parking provision. The primary difference in the versions is that three pedestrian islands were shown, with commensurate parking restrictions associated with them and that a narrow median is presented where traffic lane width permits.
 - (iii) Option 3: Option 3 replaces the currently existing 1.8m cycle lanes with cycle lanes of widths varying between 1.7m and 1.5m, and includes four pedestrian islands with associated buildouts. Median markings surround the islands, but are not marked elsewhere. This option restores the same amount of parking as Option 2 with the exception of parking losses adjacent to the fourth, northernmost island.
 - (iv) Option 4: The fourth option retains the majority of the currently existing lane markings (ie 1.8m cycle lanes) with the flush median. It adds four pedestrian crossing islands with kerb build-outs, and provides indented parking spaces on the western side.

29. The October meeting minutes record the following decision:

The attendees discussed the merits of each plan presented and agreed that a combination of the Staff B plan (*Option 3 above*) from the south end of Marshland Road up to 163-165 Marshland Road, and then Residents AB (*Option 2 above*) for the remainder, should be put forward for formal consideration by the Boards and Council. Staff agreed to reconsider parking provision in the option put forward from this meeting to ensure that the optimum amount of parking is provided.

30. Subsequently, this report identifies a further option that should be reported and considered as a matter of course.
- (i) Option 5: The status quo option for consideration is to retain the existing markings on Marshland Road, complete the plan (by addition of red cycle lane surfacing), and take no further action.

MARSHLAND ROAD TECHNICAL INFORMATION

31. Prior to an analysis of the various options, the following technical data was used to inform the process.

- **Parking:** Prior to the current marking installation, there were 178 parking spaces on this section of Marshland Road. With the markings in their current state, there are 87 parking spaces. An informal survey of parking on one week day in October (with the current markings) noted no more than 10 vehicles parked on this section of Marshland Road at any one time. On the other hand, there is also anecdotal information that the road is occasionally parked out.
- **Service Road:** There is a pull-in bay/service road immediately outside businesses at 122-116 Marshland Road. The bay allows two directional travel with parking on both sides. The original markings allowed parking on the road side of the bay island. The current marking eliminates this. Recent information from LTNZ indicates that because of the service lane's geometry, it is only legal to operate it with one way travel, in the same direction as the adjoining traffic lane.
- **Cycle Volumes:** In November 2005 cycle counts were carried out at the Shirley Road intersection. The combination of morning and afternoon peak counts had 85 cyclists using Marshland Road. Common practice extrapolates these to an all day count of approximately 160 cyclists. These numbers have decreased from previous years.
- **Collisions:** Seven nose to tail collisions have been recorded between Voss Street and Lake Terrace Road over the last five years. Twelve other crashes involved loss of control or colliding with turning vehicles. No cycle collisions or pedestrian collisions are recorded.
- **Parking Ticks:** Residential driveways on the western side of the road are unusually narrow, and parking vehicles make it often difficult for residents to access them. All options recommend marking parking ticks adjacent to the residential properties between the two islands marking the boundaries of the commercial area (as this is the zone which is typically most heavily parked).
- **Project costs to date:**

(a) Planning, consultation of full road length project, including proposals for modification of QEII/Marshland roundabout	\$ 45,000
(b) Design, survey and supervision of current layout	\$ 20,000
(c) Construction of current layout	\$ 50,000
(d) Planning and consultation since June 05	\$ 26,000
- Project budget remaining \$100,000.

PREFERRED OPTION

32. The following option is preferred by Council as offering the best balance between the users of the minor arterial, their safety and exposure to risks, and the provision of on-street parking. The road width in this section of Marshland Road is only 13 metres kerb to kerb. The recommended option considers first and foremost the function of a minor arterial road.

Preferred Option Description

33. Broadly, the preferred option leaves the now existing road markings untouched, and adds pedestrian crossing facilities and indented parking areas on the east side of the road. It also converts the service area adjacent to the shops into a one-way (north to south).
34. Flush medians have been retained to provide a median for right turning vehicles, and to provide a "shadow effect" between pedestrian islands for people crossing the road. LTNZ data indicates that flush medians have the potential to reduce the number of "nose to tail" crashes with vehicles that right-turn from the centre of the road. With the conversion of the business area service lane to one-way, more vehicles can be expected to turn right from the one entrance point to the service lane from the median.
35. Four pedestrian median islands are proposed along this section to provide crossing facilities for pedestrians. The northernmost one has been positioned both for pedestrian utility, and to restrict the use of the median as an additional traffic lane at this point. The two southern most islands effectively straddle the retail area allowing for safer pedestrian access to the shops. The remaining island is spaced approximately equidistant along the road to provide a regular pedestrian crossing opportunity.
36. Cycle lane widths are retained at 1.8 metres adjacent to parked vehicles, and 1.6 metres against the kerbside, to conform to current best practice.
37. Additional on-street parking has been provided in five locations, along the east side of Marshland Road in the form of indented parking bays. The indented parking bays provide for the reinstatement of 11 on street parks and one bus-stop. This allows total on-street parking provision of 98 spaces. These indented spaces were placed as close to the premises of the people who responded to the original consultation process as possible. Not all of the spaces are ideally placed because some repositioning was necessary to allow for the optimal spacing of the pedestrian islands.
38. This option would require the existing bus stop adjacent to number 175 Marshland Road being repositioned adjacent to 177 Marshland Road to accommodate the proposed pedestrian median island adjacent to 172 and 175 Marshland Road. An indented bus-stop and parking area is provided immediately north of the Cotton Street intersection to improve the cycle-lane bus-stop combination that is currently marked.

Preferred Option Shortfalls

39. As this option retains the new 1.8 metre wide cycle lanes and wider median, it does not allow for large scale re-introduction of parking on the east side. The number of on street parks provided is reduced to 98 from the previously existing 178 on street parks. Residents noted at the public meeting that this option does not provide enough on-street spaces, nor locates these parks where they are required and where they have been requested by some residents and the business community.
40. This option does not allow for the on-street parks on the Marshland Road side of the service lane to be reinstated as has been strongly sought by the adjacent businesses. However, the businesses have also been concerned with the risks to turning vehicles using this service lane due to reduced visibility caused by parked vehicles.
41. The 11 reinstated on street parks are provided by installing indented parking bays which form the substantive part of the costs of this option. Overall the construction work of this option is anticipated to cost \$180,000 (includes parking bays, build-outs, pedestrian islands and two changes to side-street kerbs).
42. Flush median widths vary and the minimum width is 1.4 metres. The median at this width does not conform to current best practice but does offer a greater degree of protection than a simple centre line both for pedestrians crossing, and for vehicles right-turning for the centre of the road.

Preferred Option Consultation

43. It should be noted that the residents, business owners and operators, and the local residents' groups did not support this option at the October 2005 meeting. In light of the minutes from the second public (October 2005) meeting that an alternative option "should be put forward for formal consideration by the boards and council", this preferred option has not been put into the wider public forum for discussion or consultation.
44. Consultation would typically have involved one-on-one discussions with those affected by the placement of parking bays outside their properties, those immediately adjacent to the pedestrian islands and build-outs, and those affected by the changed position of the northernmost bus stop. Subsequently, all residences and businesses on this section of Marshlands Road would have received a pamphlet outlining the proposed changes. As indicated, this has not occurred.

ALTERNATIVE OPTION

45. The alternative option presented is that resulting from the second public meeting in October. It consists of Option 3 south of 163 Marshland Road, and Option 2 north of that point. It is the option preferred by the residents, residents' groups, and business owners and operators who were present at the public meeting. It is not the preferred option of Council officers. It offers a different balance of parking availability/restriction; safety/risk to cyclists and pedestrians; and continuity of flow for an arterial road. With the exception of the right-turn into the business service lane, the risks generated overall are lower than those of the road layout prior to the May 2005 changes.

Alternative Option Description

46. This option introduces three pedestrian islands - two straddling the business area and one adjacent to 162 and 163 Marshland Road. To maintain parking spaces, a continuous flush median is not included - road space not occupied by the islands, traffic and cycle lanes is allocated to kerbside parking.
47. The cycle lanes are a combination of both current best practice where there is sufficient carriageway width, and widths equivalent to those of previous (now superseded) standards where, due to the location of a pedestrian islands and/or the re-introduced on-street parking facilities, there is not sufficient road width to achieve a 'best practice' outcome.
48. Continuous flush medians are not included. Median markings are placed only at the approach and tails to traffic islands. A narrow format median has been continued for a short section between the northernmost pedestrian island and the Briggs/Lake Terrace Roads intersection. Due to its narrowness, this section of median will not provide any protection to right-turning vehicles or pedestrians.
49. Three pedestrian islands have been placed along this section to provide additional protection for pedestrians who cross the road. Island spacing is the same as the preferred option, with the exception of the northern, fourth island which has not been included to ensure more on-street parking on western side.
50. Cycle lanes, where possible, conform to current best practice. However, due to the available road width with the introduction of the pedestrian islands and the provision of on-street parking, there are extended lengths where the cycle width has been reduced down to 1.5 metres adjacent to parked cars. This is contrary to current best practice guidelines.
51. Parking provision has been provided on both sides of Marshland Road. This will provide on street parking for 140 vehicles. Parking has been removed from the approach and departure sides of the pedestrian islands for safety reasons. Parking restoration is largely where the residents were seeking it, except for the new loss of parking adjacent to pedestrian islands, where it is unavoidable. An indented bus-stop and parking area is provided immediately north of the Cotton Street intersection to improve the cycle lane bus stop combination that is currently marked.
52. Service Road access has been made one way, southbound at the retail outlet just south of Pagoda Street. It will be easier for south bound vehicles exiting this parking area as there will be improved visibility of approaching southbound vehicles due to the parking ban imposed along the island for approximately 13 metres.

Alternative Option Shortfalls

53. The cycle lane widths proposed with this option are a combination of 1.8 metre and 1.5 metre widths adjacent to parked cars. They do not consistently meet the latest accepted standard for cycle lanes width of 1.8 metres wide adjacent to parked cars (1.6 metres is the absolute minimum width appropriate for low speed road environments). Therefore cyclists will be more at risk from car-door opening than the preferred option. It is acknowledged that the widths are better than those originally marked.
54. The lack of a continuous flush median means less protection is afforded to right-turning vehicles and pedestrians who cross at positions other than the islands. In particular, the business service lane one-way flow means more vehicles will be right-turning into it from the one location on Marshland Road - increasing the likely risks of nose-to-tail collisions at this point which would otherwise be avoided with a painted median. Low risk pedestrian crossing points will only be available at the pedestrian island locations - the removal of the existing median will mean there is no "shadow effect" which would normally afford pedestrians some risk reduction.
55. This option will cost approximately \$140,000, involving full removal of the current markings, remarking in the new geometry, and the installation of one indented parking and bus-stop area, kerb build-outs and pedestrian islands. It should be noted that the need to remove the current road markings will cause additional damage to the road surface which will increase the longer term maintenance costs associated with the project.
56. This option does not install the fourth, northernmost pedestrian island. Leaving the island out of this location does allow for the retention of all of the on street parking between the installation of the third pedestrian island and Briggs/Lake Terrace Roads intersection. The lack of a pedestrian island at this point means there is not a fourth pedestrian crossing point, nor a wide enough median to compensate for the lack of a crossing point for pedestrian protection. The lack of an island will also not address the residents' concern about vehicles forming two (and even three) lanes queuing on approach to the intersection. Further, little median protection is available to vehicles right turning into Cotton Street near the busy signalised intersection. There are thus safety risks associated with the lack of the fourth island and median - the individual issues were identified at the public meeting as those for which treatments need to be found. They cannot be addressed in this option. The risks need to be considered in direct balance with the benefits gained from additional on-street parking in this location.

Alternative Option Consultation

57. As noted from the minutes of the October 2005 meeting, residents, residents' groups and business owners were comfortable with the alternative option configuration. The meeting attendees were comfortable with the balance created between provision of additional parking, and change to standards of cycle lane widths and median provision. Officers pointed out to those present at the meeting that the matter of compliance with standards was a critical issue, and hence the staff recommendation would be for the Preferred Option, with pros and cons presented for the Alternative Option.
58. The Alternative Option has been taken to individual property owners who are likely to lose on street parking due to the introduction of the pedestrian crossing islands, or face kerb-line changes, and the business owners. The business owners (O'Sheas and the TAB) are fully supportive. Of the 23 affected property owners/occupiers, at the time of the report agenda meeting (21 February 2006):
 - 15 residences were fully supportive.
 - 7 residences had yet to respond.
 - 1 resident was uncertain about the proposal.
 - No residences had indicated that they did not accept the proposal.
59. Residences with which contact had yet to be made were sent an individually addressed letter with a set of plans on 13 February 2006. They were advised of the combined Board meeting date, and were given contact details and encouraged to make their feelings on the subject known. More detailed consultation responses will be presented at the meeting.

ASSESSMENT OF OTHER OPTIONS

60. Option 1: Option 1 consisted of reinstating the cycle lanes that existed prior to the marking changes.

All representatives at the October meeting saw this option as a backward step for the project. It did not meet any objectives concerning cycle, vehicle or pedestrian safety, although it did provide the maximum amount of on street parking. This option was not considered further.

61. Option 2: The second option presented was similar to the previous option, in that the cycle lanes were restored to near original widths with essentially the same parking provision and three pedestrian islands.

Apart from the configuration at the northern end of this option (which forms part of the alternative option), this particular version was also considered inadequate. All elements included in this option were also available in Option 3 which forms part of the Alternative Option. Hence Option 2 was not considered further.

62. Option 3: Forms the Alternative Option (above).

63. Option 4: Forms the Preferred Option (above).

64. Option 5: The status quo option retains the existing markings on Marshland Road, with the addition of the originally intended red cycle lane surfacing.

Status quo option retains the flush median which provides nose-to-tail collision risk reduction for right-turning vehicles and a non-trafficked area for pedestrians to cross. However, it does not provide solid protection for crossing pedestrians as do pedestrian islands. This option provides no additional on-street parking, and thus fails to meet the objectives of the project revision. While this is the lowest cost option, it will maintain existing levels of community dissatisfaction with Council consultation and decision making processes. It also needs to be acknowledged that if the Marshland Road project was being initiated now, process improvements would inevitably have led to providing a better balance between competing uses for road space, including more parking provision on the east side of the road. Consequently, the option to do nothing is not recommended.